Commentary on Thomas Aquinas's Treatise on Happiness and Ultimate Purpose

J. BUDZISZEWSKI University of Texas, Austin



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 16, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108477994 DOI: 10.1017/9781108775526

© J. Budziszewski 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Budziszewski, J., 1952- author.

TITLE: Commentary on Thomas Aquinas's Treatise on happiness and ultimate purpose / J. Budziszewski, University of Texas, Austin.

DESCRIPTION: New York : Cambridge University Press, 2020. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2019030628 (print) | LCCN 2019030629 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108477994 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108775526 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Thomas, Aquinas, Saint, 1225?–1274. Summa theologica. Prima secundae. Quaestio 1–5. | Happiness – Early works to 1800. | Christian ethics – Catholic authors – Early works to 1800.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC BX1749.T6 B83 2019 (print) | LCC BX1749.T6 (ebook) | DDC 230/.2–dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2019030628

LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2019030629

ISBN 978-1-108-47799-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

To those who are struggling

Analytical Table of Contents

For this Table of Contents, I have taken the topics of the Articles from St. Thomas's prologues; these differ slightly from those shown in the texts of the Articles themselves. For clarity, I have also paraphrased the traditional titles of the Questions, several of which are a little bit misleading. "Man's Last End" has become "Man's Ultimate Purpose"; "In What It Consists" has become "In What Does Happiness Lie? Failed Candidates"; "What It Is" has become "Where Then Does Happiness Really Lie, And What Is It in Itself?"; "What Is Required for It" has become "What Complete Happiness Requires"; and "How It May Be Obtained" has become "How Complete Happiness Is Finally Attained."

The general structure of the *Treatise*, then, is as follows:

- I. Man's Ultimate Purpose (Question 1)
- II. Happiness Itself
 - A. Where Does Complete Happiness Lie? Failed Candidates (Question 2)
 - B. What Then Is Complete Happiness in Itself, and In What Does It Really Lie? (Question 3)
 - C. Its Attainment
 - 1. What Complete Happiness Requires (Question 4)
 - 2. How Complete Happiness Is Finally Attained (Question 5)

And its detailed structure is shown below, with the themes of additional discussions indicated in italics.

Anti Studium p	age xx
Epigraph	xxi
Commentator's Introduction	xxiii
General Prologue of St. Thomas Aquinas to the Treatise on Happiness a	ınd
Ultimate Purpose	I
Man is not a pawn of a blind fate but a being who knows what he is doing. As we see later, supreme happiness is not attainable by man's natural powers alone. Yet in another sense, whether he attains utter happiness depends on his free choices.	
Text and Paraphrase	I
Commentary Discussion: God and God's Image	1 2
Discussion. Gou una Gou s'Image	2
MAN'S ULTIMATE PURPOSE (QUESTION I)	5
Prologue to Question I The term "happiness," which is unavoidable in this book, gives but a pale and pallid sense of what St. Thomas is talking about. Expressions such as "blessedness" and "supreme happiness" convey fair impressions of its meaning; the expression "flourishing" would be even better, if only we could keep in mind that the sort of flourishing we are thinking about is neither that of a plant, like a cabbage or artichoke, nor that of an animal, like a cat or a turtle, but that of an embodied rational being who has dominion over his own actions. Text and Paraphrase Commentary Discussion: So Many Questions	
Whether it belongs to man to act for an end? (Article 1) In either of two ways, one might deny that it is characteristically human to act for an end or aim. The more moderate is to suggest that man does not always act for an end. The more radical is to suggest that man never acts for an end, but only seems to. St. Thomas responds.	II
Text and Paraphrase Commentary	II II
Discussion: A Practical Joke by the Universe?	19
Whether it is proper to the rational nature to act for an end? (Article 2) Is man's characteristic of acting for some aim due specifically to his rational nature – is it because of his rationality that he acts in this way? Could it be that in some sense, creatures that lack reason will also act for an end? The tradition has held that they do – that all things in nature are directed to ends, even the lower creatures that do not know what they are doing. St. Thomas seeks to find out whether this is true.	

viii

Text and Paraphrase	21
Commentary	21
Discussion: Divine Providence	32
Whether human acts are specified by their end? (Article 3) Do human acts "receive their species" from their ends – are their ends what make them the species, or kinds, of acts that they are? If so, then these ends are the proper basis for defining and classifying them – something we need to know for what comes later.	35
Text and Paraphrase	35
Commentary	35
Discussion: Moral Judgment	47
Whether there is one last end of human life? (Article 4) At present St. Thomas is asking only whether ultimate meaning or purpose is in some way at stake in each human life – whether in this sense human life is meaningful. Later on he asks whether each person has but a single ultimate purpose, whether each person always acts with it in view, and whether each person pursues the same one.	50
Text and Paraphrase	50
Commentary	50
Discussion: So Many Infinities	64
Whether one man can have several last ends? (Article 5) Can a single man have more than one ultimate purpose at once – more than one independent final aim in all his acts?	67
Text and Paraphrase	67
Commentary	67
Discussion: Don't Tell ME About Happiness!	78
Whether man will all, whatsoever he wills, for the last end? (Article 6) Could it be that even though every person does love something to the furthest limit, he pursues not all things but only certain things for its sake?	80
Text and Paraphrase	80
Commentary	80
Discussion: Under the Aspect of Good	88
Whether all men have the same last end? (Article 7)	92
In the previous Article, St. Thomas made it clear that different men might pursue different ends, not as ultimate but as though they were ultimate. Now he considers whether such differences arise from a mistake: Whether, despite disagreements about what the ultimate purpose is, in some sense all people are aimed at the same one – even if they err about it.	92
Text and Paraphrase	92
Commentary	92
Discussion: Qualified Judges	99
Discussion: Qualified Judges – Trying Again	105

ix

Whether other creatures concur in that last end? (Article 8) Wouldn't all created things have the same ultimate aim? One might at first say "Yes," just because they were all made by the same God. On the other hand, one might at first say "No," on grounds that creatures without intellects have no aims. But as we saw previously, things do not have to know their purposes in order to have purposes; their purposes are built into their natures. Yet shouldn't it make some difference that certain things have intellects and others do not? What is the solution?	109
Text and Paraphrase	109
Commentary	109
Discussion: Teleology in Contemporary Science	118
Discussion: Not Only the Image but the Likeness of God	122
WHERE DOES COMPLETE HAPPINESS LIE? FAILED CANDIDATES	
(QUESTION 2)	125
Question 2 Prologue	127
In Question 1, we found that acting for a purpose is a property of man; that although subrational things also act for purposes, man does so under his own agency and direction; and that the purpose of an act makes it the kind of act that it is. Furthermore, we found that each human being pursues some aim as an ultimate purpose, not for something else but for its own sake; that he pursues just one purpose as ultimate; and that he directs everything to it. Finally, we found that all human beings have the same ultimate purpose, the fulfillment of which only rational beings are capable. But although we have given names to this ultimate purpose, such as supreme or consummate happiness, complete or perfect flourishing, and beatitude, we don't yet know much about it. Text and Paraphrase Commentary	127 127
Discussion: Just a Copycat?	131
Whether man's happiness consists in wealth? (Article 1) Wealth is the first candidate for happiness to be considered, probably because so many nominate it. It is easy to see why people would fix their hopes on material possessions, for the desire for riches is allied with other strong motives.	134
Text and Paraphrase	134
Commentary	134
Discussion: The Love of Money, Then and Now	147
Whether man's happiness consists in honors? (Article 2) Here we are thinking of the particular distinctions that we confer upon persons whom we consider deserving. Offices, for example, are honors;	151

so are prizes, awards, and other authoritative recognition; so is being raised to a higher rank.	
Text and Paraphrase	151
Commentary	151
Discussion: The Craving for Honor among Professionals	159
Whether man's happiness consists in fame or glory? (Article 3) To have fame is to be clearly known and praised by others. Many envy so-called celebrities. The psychological bases of the belief in their happiness do not concern us here. We are concerned only with whether it is true.	161
Text and Paraphrase	161
Commentary	161
Discussion: Reason and Revelation	174
Whether man's happiness consists in power? (Article 4)	176
The kind of power discussed in the present Article is not the power to build a house, to prove a theorem, to be aroused to anger, or to write a book, but the power to rule or direct others. Curiously, although people in our society readily admit to the desire to be "administrators," join "management," learn "leadership," or enter "public service," they rarely admit to a desire to rule or attain power.	1/0
Text and Paraphrase	176
Commentary	176
Discussion: Can Happiness Do Harm?	188
Discussion: Evil As Privation of Good	189
Whether man's happiness consists in any bodily good? (Article 5) Although St. Thomas frames his arguments in such a way as to apply to all bodily goods, he has the Objectors focus on the bodily good of health, and with good reason. Only a few people think supreme happiness lies in swiftness. Perhaps a somewhat larger number think it lies in beauty. But a great many think it lies in health.	191
Text and Paraphrase	191
Commentary	191
Discussion: Materialism, Soft and Hard	204
Whether man's happiness consists in pleasure? (Article 6)	207
St. Thomas is far from dismissive of common opinion, especially concerning people's own experience – something of which they have, so to speak, inside knowledge. He is also quite aware of the popularity of the view that happiness is pleasure. In his view, however, the relation between happiness and pleasure is not the sort of question that can be settled by an opinion poll.	
Text and Paraphrase	207
Commentary	207
Discussion: Hedonism, High and Low	226

Discussion: From Pleasure to "Positive Emotions"	228
Whether some good of the soul constitutes man's happiness? (Article 7) The actual enjoyment of external and of bodily goods takes place in the soul. However, there are also goods intrinsic to the soul, such as virtue. Could supreme happiness or beatitude lie in one of those? Text and Paraphrase	232
Commentary	232 232
Discussion: Can We Love Anything More than Ourselves?	232
Whether any created good constitutes man's happiness? (Article 8) So far we have been considering not only particular goods, such as wealth, but also entire categories of goods, such as goods of the body. Since these categories seem to exhaust all possible created human goods, it would seem that no other candidates for happiness are left. Nevertheless, someone might say happiness must lie in some good of the created order, just because there is nothing else he can desire. So in this culminating query St. Thomas considers all created goods at once.	246
Text and Paraphrase	246
Commentary	246
Discussion: Wanting to Be Supermen	257
WHAT THEN IS COMPLETE HAPPINESS IN ITSELF,	
AND IN WHAT DOES IT REALLY LIE?	263
Question 3 Prologue	265
Question 2 finally concluded that supreme happiness does not lie in any created good at all. But what is it?	-
Text and Paraphrase	265
Commentary	265
Discussion: Should I Take This Seriously?	269
Whether happiness is something uncreated? (Article 1) To ask whether our beatitude or supreme happiness is "something uncreated" amounts to asking whether our beatitude is something concerning the Creator Himself. Surprisingly, although in one sense the answer is "Yes," in another sense it is "No."	270
Text and Paraphrase	270
Commentary	270
Discussion: Does God Lack Something?	279
Whether happiness is an operation? (Article 2) The suggestion that happiness is some kind of activity may seem formidably abstract until we have considered just what kind of activity it may be – and for this, we must read through the rest of Question 3. Here it may suffice to remember Aristotle's remark that both ordinary	281

and educated people identify happiness with the activity of living well and doing well.	
Text and Paraphrase	281
Commentary	281
Discussion: Pie in the Sky By and By? Discussion: Is Aristotle Wrong about Nature Making Nothing	300
in Vain?	300
Whether happiness is an operation of the sensitive part, or of the intellective part only? (Article 3)	302
The sensitive powers include not just the abilities to see, hear, smell, taste, and touch, but all those capacities by which animals surpass plants. So to ask whether happiness is an activity of the sensitive powers is to ask whether it is an activity of those capacities, connected with the body, which we rational animals share with subrational animals, rather than of the intellectual powers that are ours alone.	
Text and Paraphrase	302
Commentary	302
Discussion: Are We United with God through Our Feelings	
or Our Minds?	312
Discussion: Why Does the Intellect Depend on Phantasms?	314
Discussion: Seeing the Glory of God	315
Discussion: The Unity – and Dislocation – of Human Nature	317
Whether, if happiness is in the intellective part, it is an operation of the intellect or of the will? (Article 4) <i>The intellectual powers include not only understanding, but also willing.</i>	319
So if happiness really does pertain to our intellectual rather than sensitive powers, is it a matter of understanding, or of willing?	
Text and Paraphrase	319
Commentary	319
Discussion: Is Happiness Peace?	335
Whether happiness is an operation of the speculative,	
or of the practical intellect (Article 5) Granted that happiness is an activity of the intellect rather than the will,	338
<i>is it an activity of the knowing intellect or of the guiding and doing intellect – of the power of mind to understand, or the power of mind to direct conduct?</i>	
Text and Paraphrase	228
Commentary	338
Discussion: Knowledge as Power, or as Understanding?	338
	352
Whether happiness consists in the consideration	
of speculative sciences? (Article 6) The "speculative" or theoretical sciences include all that has been called philosophy, all that has been called science, and much that has been	353

<i>called scholarship, from ancient times to the present. The question, then, is whether supreme happiness lies in pursuing these studies – in doing</i>	
what "scientists" or scholars do. Are they the truly happy ones?	
Text and Paraphrase	353
Commentary	353
Discussion: The Light That Illuminates the Mind	365
Whether happiness consists in the knowledge of separate	
substances, namely, angels? (Article 7)	367
If any exist, immaterial created beings would certainly be higher in the order of being than we are. Some have believed that they also enlighten the human intellect. Some have believed that under God, they in certain ways govern us. Some have even believed that they created us – an opinion St. Thomas rejects. However, any of these things would make them nobler objects of the intellect than either ourselves or the things that are beneath us. Then might happiness lie in reflecting upon them? Text and Paraphrase Commentary	367 367
Discussion: The Angels of the Materialists	379
Whether man's happiness consists in the vision	
of the divine essence? (Article 8)	381
Finally we reach the pivotal question, the one to which the spoilers have been pointing: Are we really united with God by knowing Him, and is this really our happiness? The argument moves swiftly, because so much of it has already been anticipated.	
Text and Paraphrase	381
Commentary	381
Discussion: Mourning and Weeping in This Valley of Tears	392
WHAT COMPLETE HAPPINESS REQUIRES (QUESTION 4)	395
Question 4 Prologue	397
In Question 1, we established that man does have an ultimate purpose, and this is happiness. In Question 2, we found that it does not lie in any created thing, and in Question 3, we found that it lies in union with the Creator. Here in Question 4, we consider the conditions it requires – "If you do not have Q, you cannot possess that union."	571
Text and Paraphrase	397
Commentary	397
Discussion: What Is at Stake?	399
Whether pleasure, or delight, is required for happiness? (Article 1)	400
Delight can mean either rational delight or bodily pleasure. To ask whether delight is required for supreme happiness is to ask whether any so-called happiness that did not include the element of delight could be	400

completely happy. This is not the same as asking whether happiness lies in delight; that query has already been answered in the negative. Text and Paraphrase Commentary	400 400
Discussion: Is a Requirement the Same As a Necessity?	410
Whether in happiness vision ranks before delight? (Article 2) We saw in the previous Article that in one sense happiness requires the vision of God, and in another sense it requires the delight of this vision. Even though they are inseparable, it makes sense to ask which is more fundamental – and so we do.	412
Text and Paraphrase	412
Commentary	412
Discussion: Delightetarians	422
Whether comprehension is necessary for happiness? (Article 3) Previously St. Thomas argued that we need not comprehend God to be happy, and that, being finite, we cannot do so anyway. Yet the tradition seems, at least, to say that in some sense, happiness does require comprehending Him. What then is the truth of the matter? Plainly it needs to be unraveled.	424
Text and Paraphrase	424
Commentary	424
Discussion: The Number of the Intellectual Powers	434
Whether rectitude of the will is necessary for happiness? (Article 4) All three Objectors accept what has been shown previously: Happiness is the mind's possession and enjoyment of truth as such, which lies in the vision of God. However, two of them argue that even a person with a crooked will can attain such knowledge. The third argues that even if a straight and upright will is necessary for the attainment of it, it ceases to be necessary once the knowledge is in hand. St. Thomas responds.	436
Text and Paraphrase	436
Commentary Discussion: God Pills and Other Gimmicks	436
Discussion: God This and Other Gimmicks Discussion: Divinity without Deity	443 444
Whether the body is necessary for man's happiness? (Article 5) St. Thomas believes that the immortality of the soul can be demonstrated not only from faith but also from reason. What does come uniquely from faith is the doctrine of the general resurrection: That after a period of time, the separated souls of the dead will be reunited with their bodies. Consequently, the question of whether souls can be happy while separated from their bodies should be of interest to everyone. Although Christian tradition holds that separated souls can be happy, it is not at first obvious how they could be, because the human person is a union of body and soul. This Article is one of the longest in the Treatise	444 448

on Happiness and Ultimate Purpose, *perhaps because over the course of his life St. Thomas changed his mind about one of the issues involved in the question.*

Text and Paraphrase	448
Commentary	448
Discussion: Overflow	471
Discussion: Mortal and Immortal Souls	473
Discussion: How Can Separated Souls Understand Anything?	474
Discussion: Do All Dogs Go to Heaven?	475

Whether perfection of the body is necessary for happiness? (Article 6) 477 St. Thomas argued in the previous Article that the reunion of the redeemed soul with its body does not increase its happiness in intensity, but it does increase it in extent, because now the body participates in the soul's happiness by "a kind of overflow." If supreme happiness does require the body, then it is reasonable to ask whether it also requires that the body be in perfect condition. Above all, this would mean that the body is perfectly obedient to the soul, no longer subject to the humiliations that result from the Fall.

Text and Paraphrase	477
Commentary	477
Discussion: The Redemption of the Body	487
Discussion: The "Spiritual Body"	490

Whether any external goods are necessary for happiness? (Article 7) 493 It might seem to follow as a matter of course that if the body is required for supreme happiness, then so are the external goods that the body needs. However, several other things complicate the question. We must distinguish between the essence of happiness and the means to it; between what is needed and what is fitting; between complete and incomplete happiness; and between the conditions of our bodies in the next life and in this one.

Text and Paraphrase	493
Commentary	493
Discussion: The Contemplative and Active Lives	507

Whether the fellowship of friends is necessary for happiness? (Article 8) 509 Certain people are offended by St. Thomas's teaching that the consummate happiness of the redeemed souls in the life to come does not need the fellowship of friends. But if they are complete in God, how could it? This does not mean that they have no love for their friends; it means that their love for them is greater still, because, as a flawless reflection of God's own love, it too is perfectly gratuitous. Now, perhaps for the first time, they do not love to be loved in return; they only love.

Text and Paraphrase

Commentary	509
Discussion: I Refuse to Be Happy Unless Doris Is There, Too	520
HOW COMPLETE HAPPINESS IS FINALLY ATTAINED (QUESTION 5)	521
Question 5 Prologue In one sense, we have already considered the attainment of happiness, for in Question 4 we investigated the requirements that must be fulfilled in order to have it. This turned out to be a more complex question than might have been expected, because there is more than one sense in which a thing can be required for happiness. However, the requirements of happiness are not the only things we need to know about the possibility of its achievement and loss. We turn to these other things now. Text and Paraphrase Commentary	523 523 523 523
Discussion: Leftovers?	525
Whether man can attain happiness? (Article 1) A few people hold that life is so full of suffering that it is "better never to have been." A far greater number hold that supreme happiness is unattainable, so the wise person takes what he can get and "settles." In the present Article, St. Thomas challenges these views. To be sure, if consummate happiness really were unreachable, then giving up the quest might be the only reasonable course of action. Surprisingly, though, many refuse even to consider the possibility of its attainment.	526
Text and Paraphrase Commentary Discussion: If Happiness Can Be Attained, What's Wrong with Me?	526 526 538
Whether one man can be happier than another? (Article 2) If we are speaking of the incomplete happiness of this life, then it is obvious that one can have more or less of it than another. But that is not the question, for we are speaking of the complete and consummate happiness that leaves nothing to be desired. Is it possible for someone to have more or less of that? Can there be degrees of what cannot be improved?	540
Text and Paraphrase Commentary	540 540
Discussion: Happiness and Love	549
Whether one can be happy in this life? (Article 3) It is a curious thing: If one asks whether supreme happiness is possible, some people insist that it is not; yet if one asks whether supreme happiness is possible in the present life, some of the same people insist that it is. The only thing these two answers have in common is a resolution to deny that supreme happiness is possible in the next life: "Here, or nowhere!"	551

Text and Paraphrase	551
Commentary Discussion: Has Not Man a Hard Service upon Earth?	551 563
Whether happiness once had can be lost? (Article 4)	568
The respondeo or "I answer that" in this Article is the longest in the Treatise on Happiness and Ultimate Purpose. No doubt this is mostly because the problem itself is complex, but perhaps St. Thomas also wants to make sure that we get the point. If we could reach our final destination, but not stay there, what hope would there be in human life? Text and Paraphrase Commentary Discussion: Partakers of the Divine Nature	568 568 583
Discussion: But Didn't the Fallen Angels Lose Their Happiness?	584
Whether man can attain happiness by his natural powers?	
(Article 5)	586
Can we acquire supreme happiness by our natural abilities alone? The problem is more subtle than it appears. Perhaps the answer is "Yes", perhaps "No" on grounds that we need supernatural help. But if "No," then in what sense can happiness be considered our nature's fulfillment?	
Text and Paraphrase	586
Commentary	586
Discussion: If Perfect and Imperfect Happiness Are Different Things,	
Then Why Are They Both Called Happiness?	599
Discussion: If We Cannot Give Perfect Happiness to Ourselves,	,
Can We at Least Assuage Our Own Sadness?	600
Whether man attains happiness through the action of some	
higher creature? (Article 6)	602
In the previous Article, St. Thomas showed that no human being can achieve supreme happiness by his own natural powers. However, during the course of the argument he maintained that man can achieve supreme happiness by the power of God. Someone might ask: Is God our only resort? Even if our own powers do not suffice, can we attain supreme happiness by any power superior to ours, but short of His?	
Text and Paraphrase	602
Commentary	602
Discussion: How Could Anyone Know Anything about Angels, Anyway?	615
Whether any good works are necessary that man may receive	
happiness from God? (Article 7) The query is not whether we can do anything by our own power to make ourselves supremely happy, for we have already seen that we cannot. Nor are we asking whether we can do anything by our own power to deserve supreme happiness, as though we had a claim upon God as an	618

equal. Only one point is at issue: Does God require us to conduct	
ourselves in a certain way to receive happiness at the Divine hands?	
Text and Paraphrase	618
Commentary	618
Discussion: The Paradox of Merit	631
Whether every man desires happiness? (Article 8)	633
Does everyone really desire supreme happiness? Think of a person who	
says, "I want something, but I don't know what I want." In one sense he	
knows what this "something" is: It is what he wants. In another sense he	
does not know what it is: He does not know what specific thing will	
satisfy his desire. Since by now St. Thomas has shown exactly where	
supreme happiness does lie, he is finally in a position to investigate who	
really wants it – and in what sense.	
Text and Paraphrase	633
Commentary	633
Discussion: Wanting to Suffer	645
Discussion: Beatitude and the Beatitudes	646
Afterword: So What Is Our Ultimate Purpose? What Is Happiness?	651
Index	654